

CADTH Reference List

Equine-Assisted Therapy for Mental Health Conditions

May 2023

Summary of Abstracts



Authors: Lindsay Ritchie, Melissa Severn

Contributor: Robyn Haas

Cite As: Equine-Assisted Therapy for Mental Health Conditions. (CADTH reference list: summary of abstracts). Ottawa: CADTH; 2023 May.

Disclaimer: The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policymakers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up to date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of Health Canada, Canada's provincial or territorial governments, other CADTH funders, or any third-party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

About CADTH: CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

Funding: CADTH receives funding from Canada's federal, provincial, and territorial governments, with the exception of Quebec.

Questions or requests for information about this report can be directed to requests@cadth.ca



Key Message

We found 2 randomized controlled trials and 1 nonrandomized study about the clinical effectiveness of equine-assisted therapy as an adjunct to usual care for adults with mental health conditions.

Research Question

What is the clinical effectiveness of equine-assisted therapy as an adjunct to usual care for adults with mental health conditions?

Methods

Literature Search Methods

An information specialist conducted a literature search on key resources including MEDLINE, PsycINFO, the Cochrane Database of Systematic Reviews, the International HTA Database, the websites of Canadian and major international health technology agencies, as well as a focused internet search. The search approach was customized to retrieve a limited set of results, balancing comprehensiveness with relevancy. The search strategy comprised both controlled vocabulary, such as the National Library of Medicine's MeSH (Medical Subject Headings), and keywords. Search concepts were developed based on the elements of the research questions and selection criteria. The main search concepts were equine-assisted therapy and mental health conditions. <u>CADTH-developed search filters</u> were applied to limit retrieval to health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, or indirect treatment comparisons, and any types of clinical trials or observational studies. The search was completed on May 12, 2023, and limited to English-language documents published since Jan 1, 2018. Internet links were provided, where available.

Selection Criteria and Summary Methods

One reviewer screened literature search results (titles and abstracts) and selected publications according to the inclusion criteria presented in <u>Table 1</u>. Full texts of study publications were not reviewed. The Overall Summary of Findings was based on information available in the abstracts of selected publications.

Criteria	Description
Population	Adults with mental health conditions (e.g., depression, anxiety disorders, posttraumatic stress disorder, substance use disorders)
Intervention	Equine-assisted therapy as an adjunct to usual care
Comparator	Usual care alone (e.g., psychotherapy, pharmacotherapy)
Outcomes	Clinical benefits (e.g., psychological symptoms, function, quality of life, patient satisfaction) and harms (e.g., adverse events)
Study designs	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, randomized controlled trials, nonrandomized studies

Table 1: Selection Criteria



Results

Two randomized controlled trials (RCTs)^{1,2} and 1 nonrandomized study³ were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of equine-assisted therapy as an adjunct to usual care for adults with mental health conditions. No relevant health technology assessments or systematic reviews were identified.

Additional references of potential interest that did not meet the inclusion criteria are provided in <u>Appendix 1</u>.

Overall Summary of Findings

Two RCTs^{1,2} and 1 non-randomized study³ were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of equineassisted therapy as an adjunct to usual care for adults with mental health conditions. Both RCTs^{1,2} compared equine-assisted therapy to a control group in veterans with posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD). One RCT¹ found significant changes in PTSD symptom scores and resilience scores, with no difference between the equine-assisted psychotherapy and standard therapy groups. Another RCT² reported that military veterans in the therapeutic horseback riding group had significant decreases in PTSD symptom scores but no change in coping self-efficacy, emotional regulation, or social and emotional loneliness scores. The nonrandomized study³ investigated equine-assisted short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy in adults with intrapsychic and interpersonal problems. For both conditions, the authors found a significant decline in psychological dysfunction, with no difference between equine-assisted therapy and standard care.³



References

Health Technology Assessments

No literature identified.

Systematic Reviews

No literature identified.

Randomized Controlled Trials

- 1. Burton LE, Qeadan F, Burge MR. Efficacy of equine-assisted psychotherapy in veterans with posttraumatic stress disorder. *J.* Jan 2019; 17(1):14-19. PubMed
- 2. Johnson RA, Albright DL, Marzolf JR, et al. Effects of therapeutic horseback riding on post-traumatic stress disorder in military veterans. *Mil.* 01 19 2018; 5(1):3. PubMed

Non-Randomized Studies

3. Kovacs G, van Dijke A, Leontjevas R, Enders-Slegers MJ. The Relevance of Internal Working Models of Self and Others for Equine-Assisted Psychodynamic Psychotherapy. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 08 30 2022; 19(17):30. PubMed



Appendix 1: References of Potential Interest

Previous CADTH Reports

CADTH. Canine and Equine Therapy for Mental Health: A Review of Clinical Effectiveness. Ottawa: CADTH; 2019. <u>https://www.cadth</u> <u>.ca/canine-and-equine-therapy-mental-health-review-clinical-effectiveness</u> Accessed 2023 May 15.

Systematic Reviews

Mixed Population – Adults and Children

Fennig MW, Weber E, Santos B, Fitzsimmons-Craft EE, Wilfley DE. Animal-assisted therapy in eating disorder treatment: A systematic review. Eat. 12 2022; 47:101673. PubMed

Unclear Comparator

- Kovacs G, van Dijke A, Enders-Slegers MJ. Psychodynamic Based Equine-Assisted Psychotherapy in Adults with Intertwined Personality Problems and Traumatization: A Systematic Review. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 08 05 2020; 17(16):05. PubMed
- Boss L, Branson S, Hagan H, Krause-Parello C. A Systematic Review of Equine-Assisted Interventions in Military Veterans Diagnosed with PTSD. *J Veterans Stud.* 2019;5(1):23-33. <u>https://journal-veterans-studies.org/articles/10.21061/jvs.v5i1.134</u> Accessed 2023 May 15.
- Stern C, Chur-Hansen A. An umbrella review of the evidence for equine-assisted interventions. *Aust J Psychol*. Dec 2019; 71(4):361-374.
- Jormfeldt H, Carlsson IM. Equine-Assisted Therapeutic Interventions Among Individuals Diagnosed With Schizophrenia. A Systematic Review. *Issues Ment Health Nurs*. Aug 2018; 39(8):647-656. <u>PubMed</u>

Type of Animal-Assisted Therapy Not Specified

- Cordani C, Young VM, Arienti C, et al. Cognitive impairment, anxiety and depression: a map of Cochrane evidence relevant to rehabilitation for people with post COVID-19 condition. *Eur J Phys Rehabil Med.* Dec 2022; 58(6):880-887. <u>PubMed</u>
- Hediger K, Wagner J, Kunzi P, et al. Effectiveness of animal-assisted interventions for children and adults with post-traumatic stress disorder symptoms: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Eur J Psychotraumatol.* 2021; 12(1):1879713. <u>PubMed</u>
- Parbery-Clark C, Lubamba M, Tanner L, McColl E. Animal-Assisted Interventions for the Improvement of Mental Health Outcomes in Higher Education Students: A Systematic Review of Randomised Controlled Trials. Int J Environ Res Public Health. 10 14 2021; 18(20):14. PubMed
- Phadsri S, Shioji R, Tanimura A, Jaknissai J, Apichai S, Sookruay T. Nonpharmacological Treatment for Supporting Social Participation of Adults with Depression. *Occup Ther Int.* 2021 Apr 29; 2021:8850364. <u>PubMed</u>
- Hawkins EL, Hawkins RD, Dennis M, Williams JM, Lawrie SM. Animal-assisted therapy for schizophrenia and related disorders: A systematic review. J Psychiatr Res. 08 2019; 115:51-60. PubMed
- Charry-Sanchez JD, Pradilla I, Talero-Gutierrez C. Animal-assisted therapy in adults: A systematic review. *Complement Ther Clin Pract.* Aug 2018; 32:169-180. <u>PubMed</u>
- Spattini L, Mattei G, Raisi F, Ferrari S, Pingani L, Galeazzi GM. Efficacy of animal assisted therapy on people with mental disorders: An update on the evidence. *Minerva Psichiatr.* Mar 2018; 59(1):54-66.

Randomized Controlled Trials

Adults Not Specified

Gatti F, Walderhaug E, Kern-Godal A, Lysell J, Arnevik EA. Complementary horse-assisted therapy for substance use disorders: a randomized controlled trial. Addict Sci Clin Pract. 02 04 2020; 15(1):7. PubMed



Nonrandomized Studies

Alternative Population – People Experiencing Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Their Partners

Willmund G, Zimmermann P, Alliger-Horn C, et al. Equine-assisted psychotherapy with traumatized couples-Improvement of relationship quality and psychological symptoms. *J Marital Fam Ther*. Oct 2021; 47(4):925-944. <u>PubMed</u>

Single-Arm Before-And-After

- Cappelen H, Ivarsson A, Jormfeldt H. The Effects of an Equine-Assisted Therapeutic Intervention on Well-Being in Persons Diagnosed with Schizophrenia. A Pilot Study. *Issues Ment Health Nurs*. Feb 2023; 44(2):104-111. PubMed
- Marchand WR, Lackner R, Hartquist A, Finnell L, Nazarenko E. Evaluation of a mindfulness and self-compassion-based psychotherapy incorporating horses for Veterans who have experienced trauma. *Complement Ther Med.* Mar 2023; 72:102914. <u>PubMed</u>
- Marchand WR, Smith J, Hoopes KH, et al. A pilot observational study of horsemanship skills training for veterans with posttraumatic stress disorder. *Complement Ther Med.* Mar 2023; 72:102910. PubMed
- Hoopes KH, Osborne M, Marchand WR, et al. A pilot observational study of recreational trail riding for Veterans with addictive disorders. *Complement Ther Med.* May 2022; 65:102813. PubMed
- Marchand WR, Joubert K, Smith J, et al. A Pilot Observational Study of Implementing an Equine-Assisted Services Program Within a VA Medical Center Residential Substance Use Disorder Treatment Program. Mil Med. Mar 01 2022; 01:01. PubMed
- Fisher PW, Lazarov A, Lowell A, et al. Equine-Assisted Therapy for Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Among Military Veterans: An Open Trial. J Clin Psychiatry. 08 31 2021; 82(5):31. PubMed
- Shelef A, Brafman D, Rosing T, Weizman A, Stryjer R, Barak Y. Equine Assisted Therapy for Patients with Post Traumatic Stress Disorder: A Case Series Study. Mil Med. 10 01 2019; 184(9-10):394-399. PubMed
- Wharton T, Whitworth J, Macauley E, Malone M. Pilot testing a manualized equine-facilitated cognitive processing therapy (EF-CPT) intervention for PTSD in veterans. *Psychiatr Rehabil J*. Sep 2019; 42(3):268-276. PubMed
- Malinowski K, Yee C, Tevlin JM, et al. The Effects of Equine Assisted Therapy on Plasma Cortisol and Oxytocin Concentrations and Heart Rate Variability in Horses and Measures of Symptoms of Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder in Veterans. *J Equine Vet Sci.* May 2018; 64:17-26. <u>PubMed</u>
- Romaniuk M, Evans J, Kidd C. Evaluation of an equine-assisted therapy program for veterans who identify as 'wounded, injured or ill' and their partners. *PLoS One*. 2018; 13(9):e0203943. <u>PubMed</u>

Additional References

Scoping Reviews

- Diaz L, Gormley MA, Coleman A, et al. Equine-assisted services for individuals with substance use disorders: a scoping review. Subst Abuse Treat Prev Policy. 12 14 2022; 17(1):81. PubMed
- Kinney AR, Eakman AM, Lassell R, Wood W. Equine-assisted interventions for veterans with service-related health conditions: a systematic mapping review. Mil. 08 29 2019; 6(1):28. PubMed