

CADTH RAPID RESPONSE REPORT: SUMMARY OF ABSTRACTS

# Hand Hygiene and Glove Use in Dental Settings: Clinical Effectiveness, Cost-Effectiveness, and Guidelines

Service Line: Rapid Response Service

Version: 1.0

Publication Date: April 18, 2019

Report Length: 7 Pages



Authors: Camille Dulong, Robyn Butcher

Cite As: Hand Hygiene and Glove Use in Dental Settings: Clinical Effectiveness, Cost-Effectiveness, and Guidelines. Ottawa: CADTH; 2019 April. (CADTH rapid response report: summary of abstracts).

**Disclaimer:** The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policy-makers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up-to-date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of Health Canada, Canada's provincial or territorial governments, other CADTH funders, or any third-party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

**About CADTH:** CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

Funding: CADTH receives funding from Canada's federal, provincial, and territorial governments, with the exception of Quebec.



#### **Research Questions**

- What is the clinical evidence regarding hand hygiene techniques or glove use in dental settings?
- 2. What is the cost-effectiveness of hand hygiene techniques or glove use in dental settings?
- 3. What are the evidence-based guidelines regarding hand hygiene techniques or glove use in dental settings?

## **Key Findings**

One systematic review was identified regarding clinical effectiveness of gloves in dental care settings. No relevant economic evaluations or evidence-based guidelines were identified.

#### **Methods**

A limited literature search was conducted on key resources including Medline via Ovid, the Cochrane Library, University of York Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD) databases, Canadian and major international health technology agencies, as well as a focused Internet search. No filters were applied to limit the retrieval by study type. Where possible, retrieval was limited to the human population. The search was also limited to English language documents published between January 1, 2009 and April 3, 2019. Internet links were provided, where available.

#### **Selection Criteria**

One reviewer screened citations and selected studies based on the inclusion criteria presented in Table 1.

**Table 1: Selection Criteria** 

Population	Any patient undergoing a dental examination or procedure
Interventions	Hand hygiene products or techniques (e.g., soap and water, antibacterial solutions, surgical scrubs) Gloves (e.g., nitrile [clean] gloves, surgical [sterile] gloves, polyethylene over gloves)
Comparator	Q1-2: Any products or techniques compared with each other or compared with no hand hygiene Q3: No comparator
Outcomes	Q1: Clinical evidence, safety (e.g., infection transmission) Q2: Cost-effectiveness Q3: Guidelines and best practice
Study Designs	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, meta-analyses, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations, evidence-based guidelines



#### Results

Rapid Response reports are organized so that the higher quality evidence is presented first. Therefore, health technology assessment reports, systematic reviews, and meta-analyses are presented first. These are followed by randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations, and evidence-based guidelines.

One systematic review was identified regarding the clinical effectiveness and use of hand gloves in dental care settings. No relevant health technology assessments, randomized controlled trials, economic evaluations, or evidence-based guidelines were identified.

Additional references of potential interest are provided in the appendix.

### **Overall Summary of Findings**

The authors of the systematic review¹assessed whether the use of sterile gloves reduced surgical site infection (SSI) post-operatively compared to non-sterile gloves. Fourteen articles met the inclusion criteria for the systematic review and thirteen articles were included in the meta-analysis. Overall, the researchers concluded that there was no difference in postoperative SSI, with sterile or non-sterile gloves having comparable rates of SSI.¹

#### References Summarized

Health Technology Assessments

No literature identified.

#### Systematic Reviews and Meta-analyses

 Brewer JD, Gonzalez AB, Baum CL, et al. Comparison of sterile vs nonsterile gloves in cutaneous surgery and common outpatient dental procedures: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *JAMA Dermatol*. 2016 09 01;152(9):1008-1014.
 PubMed: PM27487033

Randomized Controlled Trials

No literature identified.

Non-Randomized Studies

No literature identified.

**Economic Evaluations** 

No literature identified.

Guidelines and Recommendations

No literature identified.



# **Appendix** — Further Information

#### **Previous CADTH Reports**

- Disposable, non-sterile gloves for minor surgical procedures: a review of clinical evidence. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary with critical appraisal). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2017: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-non-sterile-gloves-minor-surgical-procedures-review-clinical-evidence-0">https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-non-sterile-gloves-minor-surgical-procedures-review-clinical-evidence-0</a>. Accessed 2019 April 18.
- Non-alcohol-based hand rubs: a review of clinical effectiveness and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary with critical appraisal). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2017: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/non-alcohol-based-hand-rubs-review-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines">https://www.cadth.ca/non-alcohol-based-hand-rubs-review-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines</a>. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.
- Non-alcohol-based hand rubs: clinical effectiveness and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary of abstracts). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2015: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/non-alcohol-based-hand-rubs-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines">https://www.cadth.ca/non-alcohol-based-hand-rubs-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines</a>. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.
- Hand sanitizers for the prevention of infection transmission: comparative clinical effectiveness and clinical evidence. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary of abstracts). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2014: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/hand-sanitizers-prevention-infection-transmission-comparative-clinical-effectiveness-and-clinical">https://www.cadth.ca/hand-sanitizers-prevention-infection-transmission-comparative-clinical-effectiveness-and-clinical</a>. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.
- Alcohol with chlorhexidine hand sanitizers: clinical effectiveness and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary of abstracts). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2014: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/alcohol-chlorhexidine-hand-sanitizers-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines">https://www.cadth.ca/alcohol-chlorhexidine-hand-sanitizers-clinical-effectiveness-and-guidelines</a>. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.
- Disposable gloves for use in healthcare settings: a review of the clinical and cost-effectiveness, safety, and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary with critical appraisal). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2013:
   https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-gloves-use-healthcare-settings-review-clinical-and-cost-effectiveness-safety-and. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.
- 8. Disposable gloves for use in healthcare settings: clinical and cost-effectiveness, safety, and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: reference list). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2012: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-gloves-use-healthcare-settings-clinical-and-cost-effectiveness-safety-and-guidelines">https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-gloves-use-healthcare-settings-clinical-and-cost-effectiveness-safety-and-guidelines</a>. Accessed 2019 April 18.
- Disposable gloves for use in healthcare settings: a review of the clinical effectiveness, safety, cost-effectiveness, and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2011: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-gloves-use-healthcare-settings-review-clinical-effectiveness-safety-cost-effectiveness.">https://www.cadth.ca/disposable-gloves-use-healthcare-settings-review-clinical-effectiveness-safety-cost-effectiveness.</a>. Accessed 2019 April 18.
- Hand hygiene for the prevention of infection transmission: clinical evidence and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2010: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/hand-hygiene-prevention-infection-transmission-clinical-evidence-and-guidelines-0">https://www.cadth.ca/hand-hygiene-prevention-infection-transmission-clinical-evidence-and-guidelines-0</a>. Accessed 2019 April 18.



- Frequent use of alcohol-based hand sanitizers: safety and guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2010: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/frequent-use-alcohol-based-hand-sanitizers-safety-and-guidelines-0">https://www.cadth.ca/frequent-use-alcohol-based-hand-sanitizers-safety-and-guidelines-0</a>. Accessed 2019 April 18.
- Alcohol and non-alcohol-based hand sanitizers: clinical effectiveness and safety. (CADTH Rapid response report). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2009: <a href="https://www.cadth.ca/alcohol-and-non-alcohol-based-hand-sanitizers-clinical-effectiveness-and-safety-0">https://www.cadth.ca/alcohol-and-non-alcohol-based-hand-sanitizers-clinical-effectiveness-and-safety-0</a>. Accessed 2019 Apr 18

#### Non-Randomized Studies - Non Patient-Related Health Outcomes

 Niazi SA, Vincer L, Mannocci F. Glove contamination during endodontic treatment is one of the sources of nosocomial endodontic propionibacterium acnes infections. J Endod. 2016 Aug;42(8):1202-1211.

PubMed: PM27395473

14. Momeni SS, Tomlin N, Ruby JD. Isolation of Raoultella planticola from refillable antimicrobial liquid soap dispensers in a dental setting. J Am Dent Assoc. 2015 Apr;146(4):241-245.

PubMed: PM25819655

- Grant KL, Naber ED, Halteman WA. Evaluating utility gloves as a potential reservoir for pathogenic bacteria. *J Dent Hyg.* 2015 Aug;89(4):258-263.
   PubMed: PM26304950
- Holton RH, Huber MA, Terezhalmy GT. Antimicrobial efficacy of soap and water hand washing versus an alcohol-based hand cleanser. *Tex Dent J.* 2009 Dec;126(12):1175-1180.

PubMed: PM20131613

#### Guidelines and Recommendations – Discusses Washing

17. WHO guidelines on hand hygiene in health care. Geneva (CH): World Health Organization; 2009:

http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2009/9789241597906\_eng.pdf. Accessed 2019 Apr 18.

See: Section 11 Review of Preparations Used for Hand Hygiene, Page 30

#### Clinical Practice Guidelines - Methodology Not Specified

18. Summary of infection prevention practices in dental settings. Atlanta (GA): Centers for Disease Control and Prevention; 2016:

https://www.cdc.gov/oralhealth/infectioncontrol/pdf/safe-care2.pdf . Accessed 2019 Apr 18

See: Hand Hygiene, Page, 7

19. Best practices for hand hygiene in all health care settings. 4th ed. Toronto (ON): Public Health Ontario; 2014:

 $\underline{\text{https://www.publichealthontario.ca/-/media/documents/bp-hand-hygiene.pdf?} la=en \ .$ 

Accessed 2019 Apr 18

See: Hand Hygiene Products, Page 33



#### **Review Articles**

 Seager LM. Good infection prevention: hand hygiene. Dent Update. 2010 09;37(7):478-483

PubMed: PM28809528

#### Additional References

21. Sebastiani FR, Dym H, Kirpalani T. Infection control in the dental office. *Dent Clin North Am.* 2017 04;61(2):435-457.

PubMed: PM28317575

22. Mew J. Glove wearing: an assessment of the evidence. *Br Dent J.* 2015 Apr 24;218(8):451-452.

PubMed: PM25908356

23. Smith AJ, Wilson SL, Read S, et al. Patients' perception of infection prevention in dental practice. *Am J Infect Control*. 2014 Mar;42(3):337-339.

PubMed: PM24581024

24. Fluent MT. Hand hygiene in the dental setting: reducing the risk of infection. *Compend Contin Educ Dent*. 2013 Sep;34(8):624-627.

PubMed: PM24564616