

CADTH RAPID RESPONSE REPORT: REFERENCE LIST

Islet Cell Transplantation for Patients with Unstable or Uncontrollable Diabetes Mellitus: Clinical Effectiveness, Cost-Effectiveness and Guidelines

Service Line: Rapid Response Service
Version: 1.0
Publication Date: March 02, 2020
Report Length: 7 Pages

Authors: Christopher Freige, Suzanne McCormack, Caitlyn Ford

Cite As: *Islet Cell Transplantation for Patients with Unstable or Uncontrollable Diabetes Mellitus: Clinical Effectiveness, Cost-Effectiveness and Guidelines*. Ottawa: CADTH; 2020 Feb. (CADTH rapid response report: reference list).

Disclaimer: The information in this document is intended to help Canadian health care decision-makers, health care professionals, health systems leaders, and policy-makers make well-informed decisions and thereby improve the quality of health care services. While patients and others may access this document, the document is made available for informational purposes only and no representations or warranties are made with respect to its fitness for any particular purpose. The information in this document should not be used as a substitute for professional medical advice or as a substitute for the application of clinical judgment in respect of the care of a particular patient or other professional judgment in any decision-making process. The Canadian Agency for Drugs and Technologies in Health (CADTH) does not endorse any information, drugs, therapies, treatments, products, processes, or services.

While care has been taken to ensure that the information prepared by CADTH in this document is accurate, complete, and up-to-date as at the applicable date the material was first published by CADTH, CADTH does not make any guarantees to that effect. CADTH does not guarantee and is not responsible for the quality, currency, propriety, accuracy, or reasonableness of any statements, information, or conclusions contained in any third-party materials used in preparing this document. The views and opinions of third parties published in this document do not necessarily state or reflect those of CADTH.

CADTH is not responsible for any errors, omissions, injury, loss, or damage arising from or relating to the use (or misuse) of any information, statements, or conclusions contained in or implied by the contents of this document or any of the source materials.

This document may contain links to third-party websites. CADTH does not have control over the content of such sites. Use of third-party sites is governed by the third-party website owners' own terms and conditions set out for such sites. CADTH does not make any guarantee with respect to any information contained on such third-party sites and CADTH is not responsible for any injury, loss, or damage suffered as a result of using such third-party sites. CADTH has no responsibility for the collection, use, and disclosure of personal information by third-party sites.

Subject to the aforementioned limitations, the views expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the views of Health Canada, Canada's provincial or territorial governments, other CADTH funders, or any third-party supplier of information.

This document is prepared and intended for use in the context of the Canadian health care system. The use of this document outside of Canada is done so at the user's own risk.

This disclaimer and any questions or matters of any nature arising from or relating to the content or use (or misuse) of this document will be governed by and interpreted in accordance with the laws of the Province of Ontario and the laws of Canada applicable therein, and all proceedings shall be subject to the exclusive jurisdiction of the courts of the Province of Ontario, Canada.

The copyright and other intellectual property rights in this document are owned by CADTH and its licensors. These rights are protected by the Canadian *Copyright Act* and other national and international laws and agreements. Users are permitted to make copies of this document for non-commercial purposes only, provided it is not modified when reproduced and appropriate credit is given to CADTH and its licensors.

About CADTH: CADTH is an independent, not-for-profit organization responsible for providing Canada's health care decision-makers with objective evidence to help make informed decisions about the optimal use of drugs, medical devices, diagnostics, and procedures in our health care system.

Funding: CADTH receives funding from Canada's federal, provincial, and territorial governments, with the exception of Quebec.

Questions or requests for information about this report can be directed to requests@cadth.ca

Research Questions

1. What is the clinical effectiveness of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus?
2. What is the cost-effectiveness of using islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus?
3. What are the evidence-based guidelines associated with the use of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus?

Key Findings

Three health technology assessments, one randomized controlled trial, and three non-randomized studies were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus. In addition, one economic evaluation was identified regarding the cost-effectiveness of using islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus. Lastly, one evidence-based guideline associated with the use of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus was identified.

Methods

A limited literature search was conducted by an information specialist on key resources including PubMed, the Cochrane Library, the University of York Centre for Reviews and Dissemination (CRD) databases, the websites of Canadian and major international health technology agencies, as well as a focused Internet search. The search strategy was comprised of both controlled vocabulary, such as the National Library of Medicine's MeSH (Medical Subject Headings), and keywords. The main search concepts were islet cell transplantation and type 1 diabetes. No filters were applied to limit the retrieval by study type. Where possible, retrieval was limited to the human population. The search was also limited to English language documents published between January 1, 2014 and February 25, 2020. Internet links were provided, where available.

Selection Criteria

One reviewer screened citations and selected studies based on the inclusion criteria presented in Table 1.

Table 1: Selection Criteria

Population	Patients with unstable, uncontrollable, or unawareness type I diabetes mellitus (DM)
Intervention	Islet cell transplantation
Comparator	Standard treatment with insulin and insulin related devices (i.e., injection, insulin pumps)
Outcomes	Q1: Clinical effectiveness (e.g., stabilization of blood sugar levels [HbA1c], regression of DM, decreased use of insulin/devices) Q2: Cost-effectiveness (e.g., cost per quality-adjusted life-year [QALY]) Q3: Recommendations regarding the use of islet cell transplantation for patients with unstable or uncontrolled DM (e.g., is there any specific criteria to be eligible for this procedure)
Study Designs	Health technology assessments, systematic reviews, randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations, evidence-based guidelines

Results

Rapid Response reports are organized so that the higher quality evidence is presented first. Therefore, health technology assessment reports and systematic reviews are presented first. These are followed by randomized controlled trials, non-randomized studies, economic evaluations, and evidence-based guidelines.

Three health technology assessments,¹⁻³ one randomized controlled trial,⁴ and three non-randomized studies⁵⁻⁷ were identified regarding the clinical effectiveness of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus. In addition, one economic evaluation⁸ was identified regarding the cost-effectiveness of using islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus. Lastly, one evidence-based guideline⁹ associated with the use of islet cell transplantation in patients with unstable diabetes mellitus was identified.

Additional references of potential interest are provided in the appendix.

Health Technology Assessments

1. Health Policy Advisory Committee on Technology. New and emerging health technologies for diabetes; Herston (AU): HealthPACT; 2015:
https://www.coaghealthcouncil.gov.au/Portals/0/December%202015_New%20and%20Emerging%20Health%20Technologies%20for%20Diabetes.pdf
2. Pancreas Islet Transplantation for Patients With Type 1 Diabetes Mellitus: A Clinical Evidence Review; Ont Health Technol Assess Ser. 2015;15(16):1-84:
<https://www.hqontario.ca/Portals/0/Documents/evidence/reports/eba-pancreas-islet-transplantation-1509-en.pdf>
3. Xie X, Rich B, Dendukuri N. Islet transplantation in patients with Type 1 Diabetes Mellitus. (Report No. 66). Montreal (QC): Technology Assessment Unit (TAU) of the McGill University Health Centre (MUHC); 2014:
https://muhc.ca/sites/default/files/micro/m-TAU/muhc_tau_2014_66_islet_transplantation.pdf

Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

No literature identified.

Randomized Controlled Trials

4. Lablanche S, Vantyghem MC, Kessler L, et al. Islet transplantation versus insulin therapy in patients with type 1 diabetes with severe hypoglycaemia or poorly controlled glycaemia after kidney transplantation (TRIMECO): a multicentre, randomised controlled trial. *Lancet Diabetes Endocrinol.* 2018 Jul;6(7):527-537.
[PubMed: PM29776895](https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/3029776895/)

Non-Randomized Studies

5. Foster ED, Bridges ND, Feurer ID, Eggerman TL, Hunsicker LG, Alejandro R. Improved Health-Related Quality of Life in a Phase 3 Islet Transplantation Trial in Type 1 Diabetes Complicated by Severe Hypoglycemia. *Diabetes Care*. 2018 May;41(5):1001-1008.
[PubMed: PM29563196](#)
6. Holmes-Walker DJ, Gunton JE, Hawthorne W, et al. Islet Transplantation Provides Superior Glycemic Control With Less Hypoglycemia Compared With Continuous Subcutaneous Insulin Infusion or Multiple Daily Insulin Injections. *Transplantation*. 2017 Jun;101(6):1268-1275.
[PubMed: PM27490410](#)
7. Hering BJ, Clarke WR, Bridges ND, et al. Phase 3 Trial of Transplantation of Human Islets in Type 1 Diabetes Complicated by Severe Hypoglycemia. *Diabetes Care*. 2016 Jul;39(7):1230-1240.
[PubMed: PM27208344](#)

Economic Evaluations

8. Wallner K, Shapiro AM, Senior PA, McCabe C. Cost effectiveness and value of information analyses of islet cell transplantation in the management of 'unstable' type 1 diabetes mellitus. *BMC Endocr Disord*. 2016 Apr 9;16:17.
[PubMed: PM27061400](#)

Guidelines and Recommendations

9. Senior PA, AlMehthel M, Miller A, Paty BW. Diabetes and Transplantation. *Can J Diabetes*. 2018;42: S145-S149: <https://guidelines.diabetes.ca/docs/cpg/Ch20-Diabetes-and-Transplantation.pdf>

Appendix — Further Information

Previous CADTH Reports

10. Islet Cell Transplantation in Patients with Unstable Diabetes: A Review of Clinical- and Cost-Effectiveness and Guidelines. (CADTH Rapid response report: summary with critical appraisal). Ottawa (ON): CADTH; 2014: <https://www.cadth.ca/islet-cell-transplantation-patients-unstable-diabetes-review>

Non-Randomized Studies

Alternative Comparator

11. Vantighem MC, Chetboun M, Gmyr V, et al. Ten-Year Outcome of Islet Alone or Islet After Kidney Transplantation in Type 1 Diabetes: A Prospective Parallel-Arm Cohort Study. *Diabetes Care*. 2019 Nov;42(11):2042-2049.
[PubMed: PM31615852](#)
12. Lablanche S, Borot S, Wojtusciszyn A, et al. Five-Year Metabolic, Functional, and Safety Results of Patients With Type 1 Diabetes Transplanted With Allogenic Islets Within the Swiss-French GRAGIL Network. *Diabetes Care*. 2015 Sep;38(9):1714-1722.
[PubMed: PM26068866](#)

No Comparator

13. Anazawa T, Saito T, Goto M, et al. Long-term outcomes of clinical transplantation of pancreatic islets with uncontrolled donors after cardiac death: a multicenter experience in Japan. *Transplant Proc*. 2014 Jul-Aug;46(6):1980-1984.
[PubMed: PM25131088](#)

Clinical Practice Guidelines

14. Clinical guidelines for pancreatic islet transplantation. Vancouver (BC): BC Transplant; 2014
http://www.transplant.bc.ca/Documents/Health%20Professionals/Clinical%20guidelines/Clinical%20Guidelines%20for%20Pancreatic%20Islet%20Transplantation_01Sept2014_0.pdf

Review Articles

15. Maffi P, Secchi A. Islet Transplantation Alone Versus Solitary Pancreas Transplantation: an Outcome-Driven Choice? *Curr Diab Rep*. 2019 Apr 25;19(5):26.
[PubMed: PM31025188](#)
16. Rickels MR, Robertson RP. Pancreatic Islet Transplantation in Humans: Recent Progress and Future Directions. *Endocr Rev*. 2019 Apr 1;40(2):631-668.
[PubMed: PM30541144](#)

Additional References

17. Wojtusciszyn A, Branchereau J, Esposito L, et al. Indications for islet or pancreatic transplantation: Statement of the TREPID working group on behalf of the Societe francophone du diabete (SFD), Societe francaise d'endocrinologie (SFE), Societe francophone de transplantation (SFT) and Societe francaise de nephrologie - dialyse - transplantation (SFNDT). *Diabetes Metab.* 2019 Jun;45(3):224-237.
[PubMed: PM30223084](#)